

This is a master file for Executive Summary only.



SOCIAL POLICY RESEARCH ASSOCIATES

Creating Workforce Development Systems That Work:
An Evaluation of the Initial
One-Stop Implementation Experience

Final Report

August 15, 1997

Prepared by:

Deborah Kogan, Project Director
Katherine P. Dickinson
Ruth Fedrau
Michael J. Midling
Kristin E. Wolff

Submitted to:

Dick Ensor, Government Officer's Technical Representative
U.S. Department of Labor
Employment and Training Administration
One-Stop Team
Room N-4700
200 Constitution Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20210

DOL Contract No. F-4957-5-00-80-30
Task Orders #1, #3

This page intentionally left blank.

Insert blank page here when making double-sided copies.

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	ES-1
--------------------------------	-------------

SECTION A. INTRODUCTION

Overview of One-Stop Initiative.....	A-1
Evaluation Objectives and Methods.....	A-2
Overview of Final Report	A-8

SECTION B. ORGANIZING AND GOVERNING ONE-STOP SYSTEMS

Chapter 1. Guiding One-Stop System Development: The State Role.....

Introduction.....	1-1
Goals for Guiding One-Stop System Development	1-2
Goal 1. Building Effective State Partnerships To Guide One-Stop System Development	1-3
Goal 2. Creating State-Level Structures to Govern and Manage One-Stop Systems.....	1-10
Goal 3. Guiding the Development of Local One-Stop Systems and Centers	1-15
Goal 4. Promoting Coordination of One-Stop System-Building Efforts among State and Local Partners	1-35
Analysis of Accomplishments in Guiding Local One-Stop System Development	1-38

Chapter 2. Building Local Partnerships and Governing One-Stop Systems

Introduction.....	2-1
Goals for One-Stop Organization and Governance	2-1
Goal 1. Building Effective Local Partnerships	2-1
Goal 2. Organizing One-Stop Centers into Local Systems	2-17
Goal 3. Forming Effective Governance Structures for One-Stop Centers.....	2-28
Goal 4. Staffing One-Stop Centers to Facilitate Service Coordination.....	2-38
Accomplishments and Next Steps	2-44

SECTION C. BUILDING THE INFRASTRUCTURE TO SUPPORT ONE-STOP SYSTEMS

Chapter 3. Developing Appropriate Physical Facilities for One-Stop Operations	3-1
Introduction.....	3-1
Goals of Creating Appropriate Physical Facilities	3-1
Goal 1. Providing State Support for the Development of Appropriate Facilities	3-1
Goal 2. Accommodating the Co-Location of One-Stop Partners	3-3
Goal 3. Designing Facilities that Support Integrated Staffing and Service Provision.....	3-6
Goal 4. Designing Facilities that Are Professional, Attractive, and “User-Friendly”	3-8
Goal 5. Designing Centers that Are Accessible to Customers with Special Needs.....	3-9
Accomplishments, Challenges, and Next Steps	3-10
Chapter 4. Creating an Effective One-Stop Information Infrastructure	4-1
Introduction.....	4-1
Goals for Developing a Shared Technology and Information Infrastructure	4-2
Goal 1. Improving Communication Among One-Stop Partners	4-2
Goal 2. Providing User-Friendly Access to Information for Customers.....	4-6
Goal 3. Supporting the Delivery of Coordinated and Consolidated Services to One-Stop Customers	4-11
Goal 4. Supporting Shared Accountability for One-Stop System Accomplishments	4-16
Accomplishments in Developing a Supportive Technology and Information Infrastructure	4-19
Chapter 5. Building Staff Capacity	5-1
Introduction.....	5-1
Goals of Capacity Building Efforts	5-1
Goal 1. Coordinating the Capacity Building Roles Played by Different One-Stop Partners	5-2
Goal 2. Preparing One-Stop Staff to Work Together in a High-Performance Workplace	5-6
Goal 3. Cross-Training One-Stop Staff to Carry Out Broad Functions	5-9
Goal 4. Preparing Staff to Provide Integrated One-Stop Services	5-12

Goal 5. Training Managers and Technical Support Staff in New Skills Needed in the One-Stop Setting	5-14
Analysis of Capacity Building Accomplishments, Challenges, and Next Steps	5-15
Chapter 6. Financing One-Stop Services	6-1
Introduction	6-1
Goals of Financing One-Stop Services and Allocating Costs	6-1
Goal 1. Coordinating Efforts by State and Local Partners to Finance One- Stop Services	6-2
Goal 2. Developing Cost-Sharing Arrangements that Blend Resources from Multiple Funding Streams	6-5
Goal 3. Using One-Stop Implementation Grant Funds as a Catalyst	6-13
Goal 4. Identifying Additional Financial Resources To Support Universal Core Services	6-19
Analysis of Funding and Cost Allocation Accomplishments	6-24
Chapter 7. Marketing One-Stop Systems	7-1
Introduction	7-1
Goals of Marketing Efforts	7-1
Goal 1. Coordinating the Marketing Roles Played by Different One-Stop Partners	7-2
Goal 2. Promoting the One-Stop Vision among Internal One-Stop Partners	7-3
Goal 3. Marketing the Overall One-Stop System to External Customers	7-5
Goal 4. Marketing Specific One-Stop Services and Products	7-7
Goal 5. Reaching Out to an Expanded Customer Base	7-9
Goal 6. Linking One-Stop Marketing Efforts to Promotional Efforts for Related Workforce Development Initiatives	7-15
Analysis of Marketing Accomplishments	7-18
Chapter 8. Measuring One-Stop Performance and Planning for System Improvements	8-1
Introduction	8-1
Goal 1. Defining Performance Measures for the One-Stop System	8-1
Goal 2. Implementing One-Stop Performance Measurement	8-3
Goal 3. Using Performance Measures for Program Improvement	8-7
Accomplishments, Challenges, and Next Steps	8-9

SECTION D. DESIGNING AND DELIVERING ONE-STOP SERVICES

Chapter 9. One-Stop Services for Individual Customers	9-1
Introduction.....	9-1
Goals for Transforming Services for Individual Customers	9-1
Goal 1. Simplifying Access to Services	9-2
Goal 2. Providing a Wide Range of Services to Meet the Diverse Needs of Customers	9-4
Goal 3. Making Effective Self-Access Services Available to All Customers.....	9-6
Goal 4. Providing Guided Services to Customers Needing Assistance in Choosing Careers and Finding Employment.....	9-17
Goal 5. Providing More Intensive Training and Supportive Services.....	9-24
Goal 6. Providing Targeted Populations with Specialized Services	9-27
Goal 7. Making Services Convenient to Access.....	9-34
Accomplishments in Providing Services to Individual Customers.....	9-41
Chapter 10. One-Stop Services for Employers	10-1
Introduction.....	10-1
Goals For Transforming Employer Services.....	10-2
Goal 1. Redefining The Employer As A Core Customer of The Workforce Development System	10-3
Goal 2. Providing Simplified Access to an Integrated Menu of Employer Services	10-7
Goal 3. Linking Employers to High-Quality Information Related to Their Needs and Interests	10-12
Goal 4. Improving the Quality of Labor Exchange Services to Better Meet Employer Hiring Needs.....	10-17
Goal 5. Offering Enhanced Employer Services	10-21
Analysis of Accomplishments in Developing Employer Services	10-24

SECTION E. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Introduction.....	E-1
Universal Access.....	E-2
Customer Choice	E-5
Integrated Services	E-6
System Accountability Driven by Customer Outcomes and Continuous Improvement Efforts	E-10

Factors Influencing One-Stop Implementation and Accomplishments	E-10
Recommendations	E-12

Appendices: State and Local One-Stop Profiles

Note: Appendices are Bound as a Separate Volume to This Report

Appendix A: State of Connecticut	A-1
Appendix B: Connecticut Works Career Center, New London, Connecticut	B-1
Appendix C: Connecticut Works Career Center, Willimantic, Connecticut	C-1
Appendix D: State of Indiana.....	D-1
Appendix E: Eastside Center, Indianapolis Network for Employment and Training, Indianapolis, Indiana	E-1
Appendix F: Workforce Development Center, Lawrenceburg, Indiana	F-1
Appendix G: State of Iowa.....	G-1
Appendix H: Workforce Development Center, Creston, Iowa	H-1
Appendix I: Workforce Development Center, Des Moines, Iowa	I-1
Appendix J: State of Maryland	J-1
Appendix K: Eastside Career Center, Baltimore, Maryland	K-1
Appendix L: Columbia Employment & Training Center, Columbia, Maryland	L-1
Appendix M: State of Massachusetts.....	M-1
Appendix N: FutureWorks Career Center, Springfield, Massachusetts	N-1
Appendix O: State of Minnesota	O-1
Appendix P: Minnesota Workforce Center - Anoka County, Blaine, Minnesota	P-1
Appendix Q: State of Ohio.....	Q-1
Appendix R: Wood County Employment Resource Center, Bowling Green, Ohio.....	R-1
Appendix S: State of Texas.....	S-1
Appendix T: Arlington Career Center, Arlington, Texas	T-1
Appendix U: Lake Jackson Career Center, Lake Jackson, Texas	U-1
Appendix V: State of Wisconsin	V-1
Appendix W: Waukesha County Workforce Development Center, Pewaukee, Wisconsin	W-1

EXHIBITS

Exhibit A-1	Key Features of Local Sites Included in the One-Stop Evaluation.....	A-4
Exhibit 1-1	State Agencies Involved in One-Stop Planning	1-4
Exhibit 1-2	Examples of Interagency Committees Formed to Support One-Stop Development.....	1-7
Exhibit 1-3	State One-Stop Policy Boards	1-12
Exhibit 1-4	State System-Building Goals	1-17
Exhibit 1-5	State Guidelines on Local One-Stop Partnerships	1-19
Exhibit 1-6	State Guidelines for Local One-Stop Governance and Day-to-Day Center Management	1-24
Exhibit 1-7	Examples of State Guidelines for Universal Services for Job-Seekers	1-28
Exhibit 1-8	Examples of State Guidelines for Service for Employers	1-31
Exhibit 1-9	State Guidelines on Service Integration.....	1-33
Exhibit 1-10	Examples of State Coordination Efforts	1-36
Exhibit 2-1	Examples of Initiating One-Stop Partnerships	2-3
Exhibit 2-2	Local Agencies Involved in One-Stop Planning and Service Delivery	2-7
Exhibit 2-3	Examples of the Breadth of Local One-Stop Partnerships	2-8
Exhibit 2-4	Integrating One-Stop with School-to-Work and Welfare-to-Work Systems.....	2-14
Exhibit 2-5	Examples of Organizing One-Stop Service Delivery Systems: Networks, Centers, Satellites	2-19
Exhibit 2-6	On-Site Partners and Programs	2-24
Exhibit 2-7	Examples of On-Site and Off-Site Service Partners.....	2-26
Exhibit 2-8	Examples of Policy Bodies	2-30
Exhibit 2-9	Examples of One-Stop Center Management Structures.....	2-33
Exhibit 2-10	Examples of Operations Teams	2-37
Exhibit 2-11	Approaches to the Integration of One-Stop Services.....	2-39
Exhibit 2-12	Examples of Staffing One-Stop Centers	2-42

Exhibit 4-1	Examples of Approaches to Facilitate Communication Among One-Stop Partners	4-3
Exhibit 4-2	Examples of Making Automated Services Available Through Multiple Modes	4-8
Exhibit 4-3	Examples of How Information Technology is used to Support Coordinated Service Delivery.....	4-13
Exhibit 4-4	Examples of How Technology Supports Shared Accountability for System Outcomes	4-17
Exhibit 5-1	Case Study Examples of States with Well-Developed Capacity Building Roles.....	5-4
Exhibit 5-2	Case Study Examples of Training that Emphasizes Customer Orientation and High Performance Workplace Skills	5-7
Exhibit 5-3	Case Study Examples of Cross-Training One-Stop Staff to Carry Out Broad Functions.....	5-11
Exhibit 5-4	Case Study Examples of Training to Support the Delivery of Integrated One-Stop Services	5-13
Exhibit 6-1	Case Study Examples of Allocating Shared Facilities and Equipment Costs	6-6
Exhibit 6-2	Investment of One-Stop Implementation Grant Funds in State-Level Projects.....	6-15
Exhibit 6-3	Case Study Examples of How Local One-Stop Implementation Grants were Used.....	6-17
Exhibit 7-1	Examples of Marketing Roles Played by State One-Stop Partners.....	7-4
Exhibit 7-2	Examples of Internal Marketing Approaches	7-6
Exhibit 7-3	Examples of Marketing the Overall One-Stop System to External Customers	7-8
Exhibit 7-4	Examples of Marketing Specific Customer Services and Products	7-10
Exhibit 7-5	Examples of Activities Designed to Reach Out to an Expanded Employer Customer Base	7-12
Exhibit 7-6	Examples of Activities Designed to Reach Out to an Expanded Individual Customer Base	7-16
Exhibit 7-7	Examples of Efforts to Link One-Stop marketing Efforts with Promotional Efforts by Related Workforce Development Initiatives	7-17

Exhibit 8-1	Summary of Planned Performance Measures in Case Study States	8-4
Exhibit 8-2	Examples of Planned Measures in Case Study States.....	8-5
Exhibit 9-1	Examples of Self-Access Services	9-8
Exhibit 9-2	Examples of More Intensive Assessment and Career Counseling	9-19
Exhibit 9-3	Examples of Group Workshops.....	9-21
Exhibit 9-4	Examples of Enhanced Job-Search Support	9-23
Exhibit 9-5	Examples of Training Services.....	9-25
Exhibit 9-6	Examples of Specialized Services to Targeted Populations.....	9-28
Exhibit 9-7	Examples of Making Services Geographically Accessible	9-35
Exhibit 9-8	Examples of Extended Service Hours.....	9-38
Exhibit 9-9	Examples of Remote Access to Electronic One-Stop Services.....	9-39
Exhibit 10-1	Examples of Providing Employers with High-Quality Information	10-14
Exhibit 10-2	Examples of Enhanced Employer Services.....	10-22

This page intentionally left blank.

Insert blank page here when making double-sided copies.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY: FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The U.S. Department of Labor, Employment and Training Administration, funded Social Policy Research Associates (SPR) to evaluate state and local One-Stop systems in the first nine states that received One-Stop implementation grants. The *Evaluation of the Initial One-Stop Implementation Experience* had the following objectives:

- To document the progress of the initial nine implementation states in planning One-Stop systems and developing policies to support the implementation of these systems.
- To document the implementation of local One-Stop centers operating in a wide range of environments.
- To identify key factors that have facilitated or impeded state and local One-Stop systems in their ability to meet the federal One-Stop themes of universal access, customer choice, service integration, and accountability for customer outcomes.

KEY FINDINGS

Accomplishments in Implementing State and Local One-Stop Systems

1. State and local One-Stop system-building efforts are being driven by a shared federal–state vision that emphasizes the importance of (a) meeting customer needs, (b) offering high-quality, user-friendly information tools, (c) treating both job-seekers and employers as important customers of the public workforce development system, and (d) coordinating customer services across different programs and funding streams.
2. The early stages of One-Stop service redesign have led to significant changes in the services provided to employers and job seekers. Both employer and job-seeker customers are enthusiastic in describing One-Stop career centers as improvements over the previously uncoordinated system.
3. The transformation of workforce development services from separate and discrete categorical programs into coherent seamless systems is occurring through an evolutionary process.
 - Early One-Stop implementation efforts in most sites emphasized forming partnerships, developing shared physical facilities and

shared decision-making processes, and developing integrated front-end services, such as intake, orientation, and preliminary eligibility assessment.

- Much progress has already been made in creating high-quality universal One-Stop services.
- However, many states and local sites are still relatively early in the process of consolidating enhanced services for job-seekers and employers.

Factors That Have Influenced One-Stop System Implementation

4. Factors that appear to have facilitated the development of effective One-Stop partnerships and the achievement of system transformation goals include the following:
 - A strong history of collaboration among local workforce development programs prior to the One-Stop initiative.
 - A state One-Stop design that provides clear guidelines for local One-Stop systems but also allows local One-Stop partners substantial discretion to tailor One-Stop systems to local needs.
 - Continued active involvement over time by a broad range of state and local planning partners in ongoing planning and oversight of the evolving One-Stop system.
 - The involvement of direct service staff from participating agencies in the planning of shared facilities and consolidated services over an extended planning period (e.g. 6 months to a year) prior to opening the One-Stop center.
 - Formal planning linkages between the One-Stop initiative and school-to-work and welfare-to-work systems at both the state and local level.
 - An attractive, accessible physical facility that supports both a flexible customer flow and frequent interaction among staff of partnering agencies.
 - The ability of One-Stop staff from different agencies to exchange relevant information and communicate via electronic mail on a regular basis.
 - Careful attention to the capacity building needs of One-Stop managers and local staff to help prepare them to deliver integrated customer services.

5. The development of integrated One-Stop systems is also occurring in the face of significant barriers in a number of sites. These barriers include the following:
- The absence of a federal legislative mandate for the development of integrated state workforce development systems. The fact that workforce development block grants were not approved by the 104th Congress removed a key source of federal policy support for the integration of One-Stop services by states. It also removed an expected source of financing for integrated services.
 - The resulting continuation of federal categorical funding streams, each with its own mandated targeted population, eligibility criteria, reporting requirements, and performance standards.
 - Concerns about how to ensure that individuals from groups with special needs will have access to the services they need. Each of the categorical programs has its dedicated constituency concerned about the needs of a targeted population group. For example, key constituencies are concerned about how veterans, individuals with disabilities, at-risk youth, welfare recipients, non-English speakers, and other special groups will fare in a system that is not designed around special programs for each of these groups.
 - Concerns about the job security of the workers in the various agencies currently responsible for administering each of the categorical programs.
 - Declining overall public investments in workforce development programs and services. A number of respondents indicated their concern that they were being asked to “do more with less.” If overall resources continue to decline, even an integrated workforce development system will find it difficult to deliver high quality services to a diverse customer base.

These factors, although they make One-Stop implementation more difficult, need not prevent the creation of successful integrated workforce development delivery systems. Indeed, the continuation of categorical programs helps to ensure that One-Stop systems will arrive at an appropriate balance between attending to the needs of the general public and those of subgroups facing special employment barriers and possessing distinctive service needs.

Progress in Furthering the Goal of Universal Access

6. One of the most significant accomplishments in furthering the goal of universal access has been the development of high-quality “self-access” information services, which are available to all individual and employer customers. Self-access services expand and enrich the services available to the general public and have been well-received by a number of One-Stop customers, including individuals who have not previously used public workforce development services.
7. Additionally, a number of sites have improved service accessibility by (a) extending the hours of center operation and (b) making automated information services available to customers from a number of different locations, including remote access from home and business computers equipped with modems.
8. In the absence of federal legislation providing additional funding for universal services (e.g., through state workforce development block grants), most states and local sites have been able to offer only limited staffed or guided One-Stop services to the general public beyond the services traditionally provided by the ES and UI programs (e.g., application for UI benefits, access to job listings, and referral to jobs in response to job listings posted by local employers). A few sites have attempted to make more intensive services available based on individual customer needs and interests rather than categorical program eligibility.

Progress in Furthering the Goal of Customer Choice

9. One-Stop sites have expanded customer choice by providing high-quality information about labor markets and available service options.
10. Within a given One-Stop center, customers are generally given a choice among several different modes of service delivery, such as self-access information services, group workshops, individual counseling sessions, and more intensive education and training supports. More staff-intensive services are often reserved for customers eligible for specific categorical programs, such as welfare-to-work programs, JTPA-funded programs, and vocational rehabilitation programs.
11. Many One-Stop centers have also expanded customer choice by offering a large number of brief workshops and training sessions covering different aspects of career decision making, resume development, job search, and skills needed for career advancement. Customers are able to choose between attending individual or sequenced sessions.
12. Most local One-Stop systems offer customers the option of receiving services from several different One-Stop centers within the same service area. In some systems, local centers are encouraged to tailor

their offerings to meet the needs of local customer groups and to increase overall customer choice within the local system.

Progress in Furthering the Goal of Integrated Services

13. Initial efforts to increase service integration sometimes caused organizational strains within and between One-Stop partner agencies about how to coordinate or consolidate services across staff from agencies with different ways of doing things and different “agency cultures.”
14. As a result of formal One-Stop partnerships, a number of sites have consolidated outreach, orientation, and intake services. Fully integrated intake was not usually achieved during the early stages of One-Stop implementation because of the difficulties associated with (a) conforming the information and reporting requirements for different programs and (b) creating consolidated information systems.
15. All case study sites identified an integrated system of employer services as a high priority goal, but few had completed their redesign of employer services during the first year of One-Stop implementation. Improved employer services under consideration or development in most sites included
 - improved job and resume listing services, including services integrated with America’s Job Bank and America’s Talent Bank.
 - improved software to match applicants and jobs,
 - development of a number of enhanced services available to employers on a fee-for-service basis, including services to assess and train incumbent workers and assist with large-scale hiring efforts, and
 - integrated or coordinated systems of employer account representatives to coordinate and broker services for individual employer customers.
16. In a number of sites, policy makers and managers appear to be facing a critical decision point: whether and how to proceed with further integration of enhanced job-seeker services. Concerns include (1) how to ensure that One-Stop services will remain responsive to the widely varying needs of One-Stop customers from various subgroups, (2) how to prepare partnering agencies and staff to take on different responsibilities in an integrated service delivery setting, and (3) how to prioritize the needs of different customers.

Progress in Furthering Accountability for Customer Outcomes

17. Most states and local areas made significant progress during the initial stages of One-Stop implementation in developing an overall menu of

One-Stop performance measures for future use. They also began collecting information on customer satisfaction and other measures that can be used to assess system-wide performance over time.

18. At the local level, some One-Stop centers began to use information on customer outcomes and satisfaction to support system-wide improvement efforts.
19. States and local areas had different opinions about whether One-Stop performance measures should ultimately supplement, subsume, or replace the performance measures currently in existence for individual categorical programs. A number of states are waiting for additional federal guidance on One-Stop performance measurement issues from the national workforce development performance measures policy group.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Federal, state, and local policy-makers could support efforts by local workforce development systems to further the One-Stop goals of universality, customer choice, integration, and accountability for customer outcomes by pursuing the following objectives.

1. Develop a number of different approaches that could be used by local One-Stop systems to finance the delivery of integrated One-Stop services.
 - Support the development of alternative cost-allocation practices.
 - Work to increase the flexibility of program regulations so that a number of different funding streams can be combined (preserving the eligibility requirements associated with each funding stream) to support the delivery of integrated One-Stop services to both customers eligible for targeted services and the general public.
 - Identify additional funding sources, including user fees, that can support the development and delivery of first tier (self-access) and second tier (guided or group) services to a broad range of One-Stop customers.
2. Work toward improved collaboration among workforce development agencies and programs at the federal and state level, including, but not limited to, programs funded by the U.S. Department of Labor, the U.S. Department of Education, the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services.
 - Continue to work to develop consensus about standardized workforce development reporting and performance measures on an interagency basis at the federal level.

- Encourage collaborative linkages between welfare-to-work, school-to-work, and One-Stop implementation efforts at all levels.
 - Address legislative and regulatory barriers to integrating service delivery across all workforce development programs, including vocational rehabilitation and veterans employment services.
3. Support the development of federal, state, and local interagency collaborative service approaches to meet the needs of individuals with “special needs,” such as welfare recipients, individuals with disabilities, migrant and seasonal farmworkers, and veterans.
 4. Plan for on-going investments to update and maintain over time the automated self-service information products and the information infrastructure that supports them.